Does the Race and Ethnicity of North Carolina’s Health Workforce Reflect the Diversity of the Population?

Erica Richman, PhD, MSW ● Julie Spero, MSPH ● Erin Fraher, PhD, MPP

Program on Health Workforce Research & Policy
Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH

AAMC Health Workforce Research Conference
May 5, 2016

This work is supported with funding from the North Carolina AHEC Program.
Why should the healthcare workforce reflect the diversity of the population it serves?

- Racial/ethnic minorities receive a lower quality of healthcare and services
- Racial/ethnic minorities less likely to receive routine procedures
- After controlling for insurance, income, age, co-morbid conditions & symptom expression, these differences are significantly associated with greater mortality in black patients
  - IOM report 2002 – *Unequal Treatment*
  - Sullivan Commission, 2004 – *Missing Persons: Minorities in the Health Professions*

Because it will improve people’s health.
Increasing minority health professionals is a key strategy for:

– Eliminating health disparities
– Improving quality of care
– Improving the overall health of the nation
– Reaching & serving minority and underserved patients
– Addressing disparities in culturally competent ways
– Increasing leaders and policy makers who support diversity in the workforce & diversity research

• Current climate of the health care system
  – Movement toward value based care
The purpose of this work was to:

- Evaluate North Carolina’s progress toward increased diversity in health professions
- Compare the racial/ethnic diversity of the state to that of its health professionals
- Show how we use data to elucidate where there are disparities & hopefully inform policy
- What was our approach?
North Carolina Health Professions Data System (HPDS)

- 35 years of continuous, complete licensure data on 19 health professions from 12 boards (census)
- Data are provided voluntarily by the boards—there is no legislation that requires this, there is no appropriation
- Data are collected annually (or biennially) and are self-reported
- Included professionals are those that were in active practice, with a valid license to practice in North Carolina as of October 31st of each year
What were our race/ethnicity categories?

- How a person is allowed to report race and ethnicity varies by licensing board
- In order to report across professions, people were put into the following six (6) categories:

  1. White
  2. Asian/Pacific Islander
  3. Black/African America
  4. Hispanic
  5. American Indian/Alaskan Native
  6. Other/Multiracial
Does the Race and Ethnicity of North Carolina’s 2014 Health Workforce Reflect the Diversity of the Population?
Diversity Overview of Population and Selected Health Professions, NC, 2014

Note: Data include professionals who were actively practicing in North Carolina as of October 31, 2014. Source: North Carolina Health Professions Data System, with data derived from licensing boards. Produced by: Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy, Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH.
Black Health Professionals are Dramatically Underrepresented in NC’s Health Workforce

Percent Black Population Compared to Black Health Professionals
North Carolina, 2014

- For 25 years blacks have made up 22% of the population in NC.
- In all professions (except LPNs) blacks are underrepresented (Range: 13% of respiratory therapists to 2% of optometrists).

Note: Data include professionals who were actively practicing in North Carolina as of October 31, 2014. Source: North Carolina Health Professions Data System, with data derived from licensing boards. Produced by: Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy, Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH.
Hispanic Health Professionals: Also Underrepresented but High Likelihood of Growth

Percent Hispanic Population Compared to Hispanic Health Professionals
North Carolina, 2014

- NC’s Hispanic Population: 1990 (1%) .................................................................2014 (9%)
- Professions with the highest percentages of Hispanic people are Physicians (3%), PA’s (3%) and Dentists (2%)

Median age of NC population: 38
Median age of NC Hispanic population: 25

- NC Population (n=9,943,964) 64% White
- Physicians (n=23,063) 75% White
- Dentists (n=4,681) 82% White
- Physical Therapists (n=5,827) 86% White
- RNs (n=104,996) 83% White
- Optometrists (n=1,150) 90% White
- Occupational Therapists (n=2,997) 87% White
- Pharmacists (n=10,546) 85% White
There Are No Working Dentists in NC Who Identify as American Indian

Percent American Indian Population Compared to American Indian Health Professionals
North Carolina, 2014

Of all professions examined, only Nurse Midwives, Respiratory Therapists and LPNs are represented proportionately to the NC population (approx. 2%).

Note: Data include professionals who were actively practicing in North Carolina as of October 31, 2014. Source: North Carolina Health Professions Data System, with data derived from licensing boards. Produced by: Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy, Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH.
Asians are Underrepresented in Professions Requiring a Diploma/Assoc. Degree but Overrepresented in Those Requiring Doctoral Degrees

Percent Asian Population Compared to Asian Health Professionals, North Carolina, 2014

- NC POPULATION 2014 (n=9,943,964) 64% White
- Physicians (n=23,063) 75% White
- Dentists (n=4,681) 82% White
- Pharmacists (n=10,546) 85% White
- Physical Therapists (n=5,827) 86% White
- RNs (n=104,996) 83% White
- LPN (n=19067) 67% White
- Physical Therapy Assistants (n=2584) 88% White

[VALUE] < [VALUE]
Diversity of North Carolina’s Health Workforce Has Increased Over Time

Percent of Workforce Identifying as American Indian, Black, or Hispanic for Selected Health Professions, North Carolina, 1994-2014

Note: Data include professionals who were actively practicing in North Carolina as of October 31, 2014. Source: North Carolina Health Professions Data System, with data derived from licensing boards. Produced by: Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy, Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH.
In 2015 the AAMC Reported that:

Fewer black males entered medical school in 2015 than did in 1978
Physicians are one of the more diverse health professions in NC

- Still almost 75% white
- A large part of the diversity is due to international medical graduates
- White male physicians make up >51% of all working doctors in NC
- Black males make up 4%.
- Asian (62%) & Hispanic (61%) doctors are more evenly split by gender.
- Across all race/ethnicities women are younger
Growth of White Physicians Over Time
North Carolina

Note: Data include professionals who were actively practicing in North Carolina as of October 31, 2014. Source: North Carolina Health Professions Data System, with data derived from licensing boards. Produced by: Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy, Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH.
Growth of Hispanic Physicians Over Time
North Carolina

Note: Data include professionals who were actively practicing in North Carolina as of October 31, 2014. Source: North Carolina Health Professions Data System, with data derived from licensing boards. Produced by: Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy, Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH.
Growth of Asian Physicians Over Time
North Carolina

Note: Data include professionals who were actively practicing in North Carolina as of October 31, 2014. Source: North Carolina Health Professions Data System, with data derived from licensing boards. Produced by: Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy, Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH.
Growth of Black Physicians Over Time
North Carolina

Note: Data include professionals who were actively practicing in North Carolina as of October 31, 2014. Source: North Carolina Health Professions Data System, with data derived from licensing boards. Produced by: Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy, Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH.
As older cohorts retire, there will be more black female physicians than black male physicians.

Note: Data include professionals who were actively practicing in North Carolina as of October 31, 2014. Source: North Carolina Health Professions Data System, with data derived from licensing boards. Produced by: Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy, Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH.
Education Trajectory for Physicians

- Where are the points of intervention?
- Where should policy makers focus their interventions?
Conclusions & Implications

- The last 15 years show modest increases in diversity in all fields.
- Increasing opportunities for minority groups to enter health professions may improve the lack of minority representation in North Carolina’s health workforce.
- Professions that have diversified more slowly should examine their pipeline for opportunities to intervene (examples: pharmacists, physical therapists, dental hygienists).
- Innovative methods may be necessary for recruiting and maintaining black male physicians in the workforce.
Thank you!

- Data for this report were analyzed and compiled by Julie Spero, MSPH
- Thank you to Erin Fraher & Katie Gaul for providing edits and expertise to this work.
- This work was supported by the North Carolina Area Health Education Center (AHEC).

Erica Richman, PhD, MSW
elr@email.unc.edu

Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy
http://www.healthworkforce.unc.edu
Extra Slides
## Diversity Overview of Population and Selected Health Professions, NC, 2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Profession</th>
<th>Asian/Pacific Islander</th>
<th>Other/Multiracial</th>
<th>American Indian/Alaskan Native</th>
<th>Hispanic</th>
<th>Black/African-American</th>
<th>NC POPULATION (n=9,943,964) 64% White</th>
<th>Physicians (n=23,063) 75% White</th>
<th>Dentists (n=4,681) 82% White</th>
<th>RNs (n=104,996) 83% White</th>
<th>Pharmacists (n=10,546) 85% White</th>
<th>Physical Therapists (n=5,827) 86% White</th>
<th>Occupational Therapists (n=2,997) 87% White</th>
<th>Optometrists (n=1,150) 90% White</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NC POPULATION</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physicians</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dentists</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RNs</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pharmacists</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Therapists</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupational Therapists</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Optometrists</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Professions included in analysis:

- Certified Nurse Midwives
- Dental Hygienists
- Dentists
- Licensed Practical Nurses
- Nurse Practitioners
- Occupational Therapists
- Occupational Therapy Assistants
- Optometrists
- Pharmacists
- Physical Therapists
- Physical Therapist Assistants
- Physicians
- Physician Assistants
- Psychologists
- Respiratory Therapists
- Registered Nurses
Sort these: Black Health Professionals are Dramatically Underrepresented in NC’s Health Workforce

• For 25 years blacks have made up 22% of the population in NC.

• In all professions (except LPNs) blacks are underrepresented (Range: 13% of respiratory therapists to 2% of optometrists).

Note: Data include professionals who were actively practicing in North Carolina as of October 31, 2014. Source: North Carolina Health Professions Data System, with data derived from licensing boards. Produced by: Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy, Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH.
Hispanic Health Professionals: Also Underrepresented but High Growth Potential

- NC’s Hispanic Population: 1990 (1%) ……………………………………… 2014 (9%)
- Professions with the highest percentages of Hispanic people are Physicians (3%), PA’s (3%) and Dentists (2%)

Median age of NC population: 38
Median age of NC Hispanic population: 25

Note: Data include professionals who were actively practicing in North Carolina as of October 31, 2014. Source: North Carolina Health Professions Data System, with data derived from licensing boards. Produced by: Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy, Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH.
There are no Working Dentists in NC who Identify as American Indian

Of all professions examined, Nurse Midwives, Respiratory Therapists and LPNs are represented proportionately to the NC population (approx. 2%).

Note: Data include professionals who were actively practicing in North Carolina as of October 31, 2014. Source: North Carolina Health Professions Data System, with data derived from licensing boards. Produced by: Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy, Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH.
Asian’s are Underrepresented in Professions Requiring a Diploma/Assoc. Degree but Overrepresented in those Requiring Doctoral Degrees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Profession</th>
<th>NC Population (n=9,943,964)</th>
<th>Physicians (n=23,063)</th>
<th>Dentists (n=4,681)</th>
<th>RNs (n=104,996)</th>
<th>Pharmacists (n=10,546)</th>
<th>Physical Therapists (n=5,827)</th>
<th>Occupational Therapists (n=2,997)</th>
<th>LPNs (n=209)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>64% White</td>
<td>75% White</td>
<td>82% White</td>
<td>83% White</td>
<td>85% White</td>
<td>86% White</td>
<td>87% White</td>
<td>66% White</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note:</td>
<td>Data include professionals who were actively practicing in North Carolina as of October 31, 2014. Source: North Carolina Health Professions Data System, with data derived from licensing boards. Produced by: Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy, Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Asian’s are Underrepresented in Professions Requiring a Diploma/Assoc. Degree but Overrepresented in those Requiring Doctoral Degrees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Profession</th>
<th>NC Population</th>
<th>Physicians</th>
<th>Dentists</th>
<th>RNs</th>
<th>Pharmacists</th>
<th>Physical Therapists</th>
<th>Occupational Therapists</th>
<th>Optometrists</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(n=9,943,964)</td>
<td>(n=23,063)</td>
<td>(n=4,681)</td>
<td>(n=104,996)</td>
<td>(n=10,546)</td>
<td>(n=5,827)</td>
<td>(n=2,997)</td>
<td>(n=1,150)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>64% White</td>
<td>75% White</td>
<td>82% White</td>
<td>83% White</td>
<td>85% White</td>
<td>86% White</td>
<td>87% White</td>
<td>90% White</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Data include professionals who were actively practicing in North Carolina as of October 31, 2014. Source: North Carolina Health Professions Data System, with data derived from licensing boards. Produced by: Program on Health Workforce Research and Policy, Cecil G. Sheps Center for Health Services Research, UNC-CH.